

August 3, 2022

VIA ELECTRONIC MAIL

Teresa Wilhelmsen, Utah State Engineer Utah Division of Water Rights 1594 W. North Temple, Suite 220 Salt Lake City, UT 84114-6300 Email: waterrights@utah.gov

Re: Request for Reconsideration - Permanent Change Application "a48752" (57-8033) Submitted by Courtney H. Crombie and Michael J. Jimenez

Dear Ms. Wilhelmsen:

Pursuant to Utah Code Ann. § 63G-4-302(1)(a), the Emigration Canyon Home Owners Association ("**The ECHO-Association**") hereby submits the following Request for Reconsideration regarding the Order of the Utah State Engineer dated July 14, 2022, granting permanent changes to water right claim 57-8033 allowing for continued water use from an 8-inch, 127 foot well constructed under unpublished change application "a14831" and as an unapproved pointed-of-diversion under "a48752."

As you are aware, The Utah State Engineer (the "State Engineer") is required to comply with the mandatory provisions of Utah Code Ann. 73-3-8 in assessing permanent change applications.

For each application, Utah Code Ann. 73-3 8 requires the State Engineer to evaluate: (1) whether there is unappropriated water in the proposed source; (2) whether the proposed water will impair existing rights and interfere with more beneficial use of the water; (3) whether the proposed plan is physically and economically feasible; (4) whether the plan will prove to be detrimental to public health, welfare and safety; (5) whether the applicant has shown that it has the financial ability to complete the proposed work; (6) whether the applications are for the purpose of speculation or monopoly; and (7) whether the applications are filed in good faith.

The applicant has the burden of producing evidence sufficient to support a reasonable belief that the change applications can be made in compliance with all statutory requirements before the State Engineer may approve the application.

Utah Code Ann. 73-3-8 states:

(b) If the state engineer, because of information in the state engineer's possession obtained either by the state engineer's own investigation or otherwise, has reason to believe that an application will interfere with the water's more beneficial use . . . domestic or culinary, ..., or will unreasonably affect public recreation or the natural stream environment, or will prove detrimental to the public welfare, the state engineer shall withhold approval or rejection of the application until the state engineer has investigated the matter.

(c) If an application does not meet the requirements of this section, it shall be rejected.

In the present case, there is no "proposed plan" within the meaning of the above provisions, as the underground point-of-diversion was constructed in June 1989 without public notice, has been in illegal operation for the past 33 years, is not allowed under the current change application, and impairment of surface water right 57-8947 owned by the ECHO-Association has already been documented to your office.

Please note the following for the record:

- In 1966, your office determined that the construction and use of large-diameter commercial wells in the Canyon would impair superior rights "with almost certainty" and closed the entire area to new water use applications in 1968 (*see* Master's Thesis entitled "Groundwater Hydrology of Emigration Canyon available at the website administered by The ECHO-Association at <u>https://echo-association.com/?page_id=220</u>);
- In testimony presented to your office on December 15, 1995, Don A. Barnett, former area engineer for the Canyon expressly testified that the same large-diameter large diameter well constructed in June 1989 would interfere with surface water flow of the Emigration Creek "*for decades, 25, 50, 75 years*" (emphasis added)(*see* audio recording and illustrative diagrams presented to the Utah State Engineer at the website administered by The ECHO-Association at https://echo-association.com/?page_id=2204;
- On December 18, 2019, in oral testimony before your office, hydrologist expert Dr. Hansen testified that the Canyon is currently overbuilt and future development of the Canyon unwarranted (*see* audio-video recording entitled "Dr. Hansen Testimony" available at the website administered by The ECHO-Association at <u>https://echo-association.com/?page_id=7408;</u>
- In June 2020, The ECHO-Association documented massive fissures and ground subsidence in the Freeze Creek drainage believed to be caused by groundwater mining of the Freeze Creek Aquifer (*see* arial recording entitled "Ground Collapse and Fissures in Emigration Oaks PUD" available at the website administered by

The ECHO-Association at https://echo-association.com/?page_id=3310) and lastly,

- As predicted, on June 24, 2021, the Canyon stream suffered total depletion less than 2 miles east from Utah's Hogle Zoo as reported by the Salt Lake Tribune and has recently suffered total impairment less than 1/2 mile west of the aforementioned property (*see* Salt Lake Tribune article entitled "Why is Emigration Creek – an Historic Waterway – Dry?" available at the website administered by The ECHO-Association at https://echo-association.com/?page_id=405.
- Your memorandum decision and order only allows construction of **a 4-inch** underground well, although the Applicants' predecessor in interest constructed an **8-inch** underground well in June 1989 while the Applicants has improperly used the water source with your knowledge since that date. *See* Well Drillers' Report, attached as **Exhibit A**.
- As you are aware, the record further shows that over forty (40) private-well owners have report quantity and quality impairment to your office since 1988, and the undersigned has commenced federal civil rights litigation against operators of similar large-diameter commercial wells in Emigration Canyon under the color of state authority. (*Tracy v. Simplifi Company et al.* No. 22-4032 (10th Circuit, Reply Brief, July 25, 2022)).

Until which time that Applicants have fulfilled their burden of producing evidence sufficient to support a reasonable belief that the "proposed" change application (*i.e.*, continued use of an unapproved point-of-diversion already constructed) can be made in compliance with all statutory requirements, the State Engineer must disapprove the application under Utah Code Ann. \S 73-8-3(c).

Please feel free to contact me regarding any questions.

Kind Regards,

MARK CHRISTOPHER TRACY DBA EMIGRATION CANYON HOME OWNERS ASSOCIATION

<u>/s/ Mark Christopher Tracy</u> Mark Christopher Tracy

EXHIBIT A

| Recorded: B. C | | F WI FE OI | | | | LL | ER | | , | N ppi | ication No. 02 14831 |
|---|------------------|--------------------|-------------|-----------------------|------------------------|-------------------------|--------------------|---------------------|----------------|--------------------|---|
| Copied | | | | | | | | | | | No. 57-5033 |
| GENERAL STATEMENT: Report of well driller is herei | w med | | | | | | | | C | oor | dinate No. |
| GENERAL STATEMENT: Report of well driller is herel (This report shall be filed with the State Engineer within reports constitutes a misdemeanor.) | 80 day | 78 afte | er t | he c | ith iomj | the pleti | Sta ion | te E or <i>e</i> | Cng ibai | ine ndo | er, in accordance with the lay nment of the well. Failure |
| (1) WELL OWNER: | | 2) W | | | | | | | | | |
| Name LAURIE FRASCO Address 9510 Ervingration Campon | | | | | | | | er er | raw ed t | dow Jelov | n is the distance in feet the water w static level. |
| | Yiel | d :/ | ip Le S | st m | ade ! | Ye 1/1 | | и [| • 0 | , , | 18 so, by whom 1_2 4.25 |
| (2) LOCATION OF WELL: | | | | | | <i>. i</i> mi | n. - | 114 | ƙ . | | f so, by whom 1 |
| County Scilt CriteC Ground Water Basin S 9/7 | 1 " | | | | | • | • | | | | |
| South Vert Corper | Balle | er test rinn /l | <u>(</u> | × | ••••• | g=1./ | min. | with | h | 3.0 | foot drawdown after 2/ |
| West // Corner | Tem | perature | e of | wate | | •••••• | | •••••• | | | |
| of Section / G T N R Z E SLBM out words not needed) | (13 |) WI | EL | Т. Т. | 00 | | | _ | | | |
| | Depti | h drille | d | 12 | 7 | | | fee | | hant | er of well 8 |
| (3) NATURE OF WORK (check): New Well | NOT | E: Pla | ce at | n "X | " In | the | Ppace | e or | com | bine | tion of spaces needed to designate the depth interval. Under REMARK is the color, size, nature, etc., of p al sheet if needed. |
| Replacement Well Decpening Repair Abandon I If abandonment, describe material and procedure: | desire count | the not | eacl | n ma s to h den | ore ore | urren urren ntera | ncour | ntere If wi | d in | eac anc | th depth interval. Under REMARK i the color, size, nature, etc. of |
| and procedure : | DI | ертн | T | | | MA | TER | AT | | | as soret if needed. |
| | | 1 | ╟ | TT | ŀ | T | 1 | | 1 | | |
| (4) NATURE OF USE (check): | | | | | | | | | a l | | |
| Domestic Mindustrial Municipal Stockwater | g | i | | | - | 1 | Ę | Hardpan | rlom | 8 | REMARKS |
| Irrigation Mining Other Test Well | Frot | 4 | 5 | 38 | Sand | Cobbles | Boulder | Har | Conglome | Bedrock | Othe |
| (5) TYPE OF CONSTRUCTION (check): | C | 1 | | | | | | | \neg | - | 1 Sal |
| Rotary Dug Jetted D | 1 | 10 | X | X | 1 | 1 | | | | ſ | Rect |
| Bored D | 55 | 55 | T | X | + | - | $\left - \right $ | | _ | _ | Red |
| (6) CASING SCHEDULE: Threaded & Welded & 8 " Diam. from O feet to 97 feet Gage 250 | 27 | 51 | p | | -{ | 4- | $\left - \right $ | -+ | + | + | HOVE GO |
| 4 "Diam. from 27 feet to 57 feet Gage 250 | 31 | 36 | X | | | | | | | 1 | Red Red |
| " Diam. fromfeet tofeet Gage | <u>56</u> 105 | 105 | | | 2-13 | | | - | _ | 4 | Shale-Red |
| New Reject Used | 10 | 15 | R | | 4- | | $\left - \right $ | -+- | - - | -13 | |
| (7) PERFORATIONS: Perforated 1 Yes D No # | 115 | 120 | X | | | | | + | ╋ | ť | Sandy Shall |
| Type of perforator used | 120 | 127 | | | | | | - | K | 4 | limestone- FISS |
| Size of perforations inches by inches | | | - | | +- | $\left \right $ | | +- | | +- | 10 12.7 - could |
| perforations fromfeet to | | | | | | | | | | + | drill through e |
| perforations from feet to | | | | | | \vdash | | \bot | - | | |
| perforations fromfeet tofeet perforations fromfeet tofeet | | | | +- | 1- | $\left - \right $ | | +- | +- | ┼─ | |
| | | | | | | | | + | | + | |
| (8) SCREENS: Well screen installed I Yes & No - | | - | _ - | - | - | - | | T | | | |
| The Plic Model No. | | | +- | | | | | +- | | | |
| liam. T. Slot size 12 Set from 127 | | | | | | | | + | \vdash | $\left - \right $ | |
| ism | | | | | $\left - \right $ | | _ | | | | |
| 9) CONSTRUCTION: C-BMULL LOST MALE FRANK | | | | + | $\left \cdot \right $ | -+- | + | +- | | $\left - \right $ | |
| | | | 1- | | | + | + | + | | Н | |
| as a surface seal provided ? Yes S No - | | [[| | \square | 1 | | T | | | | |
| To what depth ! /85 feet | | | + | $\left - \right $ | - - | | +- | $\left - \right $ | 4 | _ | |
| sterial used in seal: <u>Bantowa</u> - d any strata contain unusable water? Yes No D | | | 1- | | -+- | +- | +- | $\left - \right $ | - | - | |
| pe of water: | | | | \square | 1 | | T | \square | | | |
| thod of sealing strata off: | l | | <u> </u> | <u> </u> | | <u> </u> | 1 | | | [| |
| | ork star | | | 2.5 | > | | | ., 19 | 21 | 2 Co | mpleted 6 - 5 |
| as surface casing used ? Yes D | 14) P | | - | | <u>.</u> | | | , | | | |
| s it cemented in place? Yes C | nufactu pe: | S. | lame h | Ċ | | un 65 | | <u>es</u> | <u> </u> | | |
| | pe: pth to p | oump or | () r bn: | w] e = | | 01 | 5 | <u> </u> | <u>/ -</u> | ð | H. P. 3/4 |
| | ell Dri | | | - | | | | | | | ret |
| celan pressure | This | well | WAS | s dr | iller | 1 | der | | - | | |
| th | · · · · | ~ . | | | | | | lief | ່ອນ | per | vision, and this report is tr |
| | me 🟒 | (Pers | | | | | | | 4 | Ę. | 11 Service Trac |
| Controlled by (cbeck) Valve Ad | dress . | 1 1 1 | 2 | 5 | | ù | <u>)</u> | | 15 |) c | oul 5 (Type or print) |
| La ris contral | igned) | 3 | 20 | 2. | ko | 3 | 5. | 12 | | | aman |
| Does well leak around casing I Yes [] (S | a, | ···· K | *+- | <u></u> | | | ÷. | . . | | | Driller) |

USE OTHER SIDE FOR ADDITIONAL REMARKS

İ

ning waard a second a