## BEFORE THE STATE RECORDS COMMITTEE OF THE

## STATE OF UTAH

MARK TRACY,

Petitioner,

DECISION AND ORDER

V.

Case No. 21-09

EMIGRATION IMPROVEMENT DISTRICT, and SIMPLIFI COMPANY,

Respondents.

By this appeal, Petitioner, Mark Tracy, seeks access to records allegedly held by Respondents, Emigration Improvement District and Simplifi Company.

## **FACTS**

In September 2020, Mr. Tracy, President of the Emigration Canyon Home Owners' Association, made three requests for records pursuant to the Government Records Access and Management Act ("GRAMA"). The request to Emigration Improvement District ("EID") was for e-mail correspondence regarding lead contamination of water system 18143 and the use of public funds for private legal costs. Mr. Tracy made a similar request to Simplifi Company ("Simplifi"), a contractor for EID.

After Mr. Tracy's appeals were denied, he filed three appeals (2020-115, 2020-121,

Mark Tracy v. Emigration Improvement District Case No. 21-09

Page 1

2020-125) with the State Records Committee ("Committee"). Because of the similar nature of

the appeals, the Committee combined the appeals for an electronic hearing held on February 11,

2021. After carefully considering the requested relief of the parties, the Committee issues the

following Decision and Order.

STATEMENT OF REASONS FOR DECISION

1. A person making a request for a record shall submit to the governmental entity that

retains the record a written request for the record describing the record requested with

reasonable specificity. Utah Code § 63G-2-204(1)(a). GRAMA defines governmental

entities in Utah Code § 63G-2-103(11).

2. Regarding appeals 2020-115 and 2020-121, a review of the file shows that these records

requests were made to Simplifi, a private company. Although work was done by Simplifi

on behalf of EID, Simplifi is not a governmental entity. If a records requester desires

records of a governmental entity that are held by a private entity, the request for records

should be made to the governmental entity pursuant to Utah Code § 63G-2-204(1).

3. GRAMA's definition of "record" includes records: (1) Prepared, owned, received, or

retained by a governmental entity or political subdivision; and (2) Where all of the

information in the original is reproducible by photocopy or other mechanical or electronic

means. Utah Code § 63G-2-103(22)(a). It should be noted that a record does not need to

be retained by a governmental entity in order for the record to be subject to GRAMA.

Mark Tracy v. Emigration Improvement District

GRAMA could apply to a record that a governmental entity prepared, owned, or received

even though the record is retained by another party.

4. In the present case, evidence was presented that Simplifi retains records that are owned

by EID that are subject to the records request made by Mr. Tracy. Accordingly, the

Committee finds that the records requests made to Simplifi were not properly requested

to the governmental entity pursuant to GRAMA, and appeals 2020-115 and 2020-121 are

denied.

5. Accordingly, the Committee finds that EID may be the holder of records responsive to

Mr. Tracy's request in Appeal 2020-125 submitted to EID for e-mail correspondence

regarding lead contamination of water system 18143 and records regarding the use of

public funds for private legal costs. EID is ordered to do a more thorough search for

records and provide any public records responsive to Mr. Tracy's records request

including records retained by Simplifi on behalf of EID.

**ORDER** 

THEREFORE, IT IS ORDERED THAT the appeals of Petitioner, Mark Tracy, are

hereby **GRANTED** in part, and **DENIED** in part.

RIGHT TO APPEAL

A party to a proceeding before the Committee may seek judicial review in District Court

of a Committee's Order by filing a petition for review of the Committee Order as provided in

Mark Tracy v. Emigration Improvement District

Utah Code § 63G-2-404. Utah Code § 63G-2-403(14). A petition for judicial review of a

Committee Order "shall be filed no later than 30 days" after the date of the Committee Order.

Utah Code § 63G-2-404(1)(a). The petition for judicial review must be a complaint which is

governed by the Utah Rules of Civil Procedure and include the Committee as a necessary party

and contain the required information listed in Subsection -404(2). Utah Code § 63G-2-404(1) &

(2). The court shall make its decision *de novo* but shall allow introduction of evidence presented

to the Committee, determine all questions of fact and law without a jury, and decide the issue at

the earliest practical opportunity. Utah Code § 63G-2-404(6). In order to protect a parties' rights

on appeal, a party may wish to seek advice from an attorney.

**PENALTY NOTICE** 

Pursuant to Utah Code § 63G-2-403(15)(c), if the Committee orders the governmental

entity to produce a record and no appeal is filed, the government entity herein shall comply with

the order of the Committee and shall: (1) Produce the record; and (2) File a notice of compliance

with the Committee. If the governmental entity ordered to produce a record fails to file a notice

of compliance or a notice of intent to appeal, the Committee may do either or both of the

following: (1) Impose a civil penalty of up to \$500 for each day of continuing noncompliance; or

(2) Send written notice of the entity's noncompliance to the Governor. Utah Code §

63G-2-403(15)(d)(i)(B). In imposing a civil penalty, the Committee shall consider the gravity

and circumstances of the violation, including whether the failure to comply was due to neglect or

Mark Tracy v. Emigration Improvement District

Case No. 21-09

Page 4

was willful or intentional. Utah Code § 63G-2-403(15)(d)(ii).

Entered this 22 day of February 2021

BY THE STATE RECORDS COMMITTEE

KENNETH R. WILLIAMS

Chair, State Records Committee

Kannegalins

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that I mailed a true and correct copy of the foregoing **Decision and Order**, U.S. mail postage prepaid, this 22 day of February 2021 to the following:

MARK TRACY 1160 E. Buchnell Dr. Sandy, UT 84094 Petitioner JEREMY COOK
COHNE KINGHORN
111 East Broadway, 11<sup>th</sup> Floor
Salt Lake City, UT 84111
Counsel for Respondent,
Emigration Improvement District

Rebelebah Fraw

Rebekkah Shaw
Executive Secretary